

Introduction

- CERN Council decision in December 2023:
 - CERN's cooperation with Belarus will conclude on **27 June 2024**, and with Russia on **30 November 2024** (in light of the ongoing invasion of Ukraine by the Russian Federation with the involvement of Belarus)
- CERN Council decision **terminates** access of RU&BY to **experiments @ LHC**
 - unprecedented signal to future **scientific collaborations** not to trust
 - cut off **future resources** of CERN programs, and redirect to their ... effort
 - sanction seizing **intellectual property** of RU&BY scientists
- This goes much further than stopping collaboration
 - **scientific Equipment** which belongs (jointly) to RU&BY will be seized
 - **collected data** which belong (jointly) to RU&BY will be denied access
 - **scientific papers** do not give proper acknowledgement to RU&BY
 - **international agreements** on Science for Peace with RU&BY will be broken

Note: even US/UK/EU governments were very careful not seizing RU&BY property (!)

An Example

- CMS experiment at LHC: Hadronic Calorimeter endcaps
 - Russia disarmed and melted **over a million** high-quality brass artillery shells
 - in Belarus, machined into absorber plates and pre-assembled into parts of endcaps
 - delivered for CMS installation to CERN in 2002-2003: **over million pounds**
 - **Science for Peace** at its highest point
- Only one example of a joint effort, we all on LHC should be proud of
 - only one of many contributions to be seized
 - we are sure to make them regret something, but not something that was intended



Deeper Considerations

General Conditions

GENERAL CONDITIONS

APPLICABLE TO

EXPERIMENTS AT CERN

- 6.12. Any Collaborating Institution providing Equipment shall continue to make it available to the Collaboration until the Experiment has been declared completed (Article 8.2).
- 7.3. Subject to Articles 7.4 and 7.5, each Collaborating Institution and CERN as Host Laboratory shall be entitled to use any data and knowledge resulting from the Experiment for its own scientific non-military purposes.
- 8.2. Unless another duration is specified in the MoU, the MoU shall remain in force until the CERN Director of Research, in agreement with the Spokesperson, has declared the Experiment completed, the Equipment has been dismantled and the arrangements for its disposal agreed in writing.

Interpretation without having additional information:

(**Article 6.12**) LHC experiments may have to return Equipment as soon as RU+BY Institutions lose the status of “Collaborating”

(**Article 7.3**) RU+BY Institutions are entitled to have full access to data including any calibration and results, derived from that data jointly in full extent for any duration

(**Article 8.2**) The MoU with the list of Collaborating Institutions (RU&BY included) shall remain in force until the Experiment is completed

Other **ethical guidelines** exist, which do not allow kicking contributors to the experiment out and taking credit for their intellectual, material, financial contributions

Science for Peace Considerations

- Since it was founded in 1954, CERN has promoted scientific collaboration across borders, inclusiveness and open science, **transcending political and other conflicts**.
Not any more...

- Let's define objectively what is being done:

Sanction = a **punishment** imposed on **parties** who **disobey laws**

- one must have **jurisdiction** over the parties (unless **unilateral sanctions**)

- nobody claims (yet) that we punish RU & BY scientists on LHC

- therefore it is a **unilateral sanction** (on RU & BY government?)

 - it is a form of economic, diplomatic, information, **cultural warfare**

 - should be prerogative of government foreign policy, not science organizations

 - (without any judgement if it is justified): it is a **cultural war**

- One could define the approach as **Science as a tool in Cultural Wars**
instead of **Science for Peace**

New era after 70 years of CERN: we are in a state of a declared cultural war...

The Proposal

● Proposal: send a strong **message to CERN** that we want to **keep LHC Collaborations**

● Possible objections (quote from real life discussion): “it is hypocritical to support RU scientists when their government violated numerous international rules. A significant part of Russian citizens support the invasion of Ukraine. They have no moral rights to claim any discrimination. Instead, we should do everything possible to support Ukraine.”

Answer 1: Even in a state of war, the destruction or **seizure of the property** of an adversary is prohibited, unless required by imperative military necessity. Violation of this rule is a war crime. [International Humanitarian Law, Rule 50](#)

Answer 2: Even in a state of war, humiliating and degrading treatment constitutes a war crime. [International Humanitarian Law, Rule 90](#)

Answer 3: Humiliating and alienating our RU&BY colleagues will not help to support Ukraine. They are our best allies in ending this conflict. The only purpose of the cultural sanctions is to convince RU&BY residents that the state policy needs to be changed. We will only achieve the opposite. We will not limit RU resources for the war effort this way, only the opposite: we will redirect LHC funding to their ... efforts.